12.842 / 12.301 Past and Present Climate Fall 2008

For information about citing these materials or our Terms of Use, visit: http://ocw.mit.edu/terms.

12.842 Climate Physics and Chemistry Fall 2008

Natural and Fossil Fuel CO_2 in the Ocean I

Reading assignment:

Sarmiento and Gruber, Physics Today, Aug. 30, 2002

Some useful URLs:

www.ngdc.noaa.gov

cdiac.esd.ornl.gov/trends/trends.htm

http://www.ldeo.columbia.edu/res/pi/CO2/

http://www.grida.no/CLIMATE/IPCC_TAR/WG1/index.htm

Ocean and Atmospheric Chemistry

Goals for this part of the subject (I)

- The Global Carbon System:
 - Inform the class of relevant facts and figures concerning fossil fuel CO₂ emissions and their fate so as to be able to think and act in science and public discourse
 - Understand the basic processes that govern movements of CO₂ in the earth surface environment
 - Develop an understanding of how these processes are incorporated into models that predict future atmospheric carbon dioxide levels

Ocean and Atmospheric Chemistry

Goals for this part of the subject (II)

- Atmospheric Chemistry:
 - Develop an understanding of gas phase reactions in the atmosphere
 - Understand the sources and sinks of CH4, N2O, and CFCs
 - -Evaluate the past and future evolution of these gases

Direct measurements of CO_2 in the atmosphere for the past 47 years



Spatial variability of atmospheric CO₂



Seasonal cycles of atmospheric CO_2 concentrations are illustrated by measurements from four monitoring stations where the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration takes continuous readings. Analysis of the measurements shows that seasonal cycles in the Northern Hemisphere-which reflect the dominance of photosynthesis in the summer and plant respiration in the winter-seem to be increasing in amplitude. This may be a result of global warming. The dots represent monthly averages. The data are from Peterson et al. 1986; Komhyr et al. 1989; Thoning, Tans and Komhyr 1989; Waterman et al. 1989; and Gillette et al. 1987.

Figure by MIT OpenCourseWare.

Atmospheric CO_2 vs. latitude and time



Image courtesy of NASA.

"And in my judgment, we need to set aside whether or not greenhouse gases have been caused by mankind or because of natural effects, ..."

George W. Bush Chicago, May 22, 2006

Global CO₂ emissions from fossil-fuel burning, cement production, and gas flaring



Image courtesy of DOE.

Anthropogenic CO₂ emissions through 2005



Emissions are rising faster than expected



Figure courtesy of David Keith. Used with permission.

Global Oil Production



Figure by MIT OpenCourseWare.

Global CO₂ emissions by area:



Image courtesy of DOE.

CO₂ emissions by region:

GREENHOUSE GAS

 CO_2 emissions from Europe have stabilized, but those from North America have risen sharply



Figure by MIT OpenCourseWare.

Direct measurements of CO_2 in the atmosphere for the past 47 years



Atmospheric CO₂ growth rate



Figure by MIT OpenCourseWare based on Science 298: 2344.

Carbon reservoirs

Carbon reservoirs at the earth's surface.4

Diagram showing the mass distribution and transfer linkages between carbon reservoirs

Units: 1015 moles.

P

[Note that other commonly used units are "gigatons of carbon" (10^9 metric tons of ${}^{12}C$) and "petagrams of carbon", i.e. 10^{15} grams of ${}^{12}C$), which are equal to one another. To convert from units of 10^{15} moles to these units, multiply by 12 (the atomic weight of carbon).]



Image removed due to copyright restrictions.

Citation: Figure 1. Sarmiento J. L., and N. Gruber. *Physics Today* (August 2002): 30-36.





Ocean uptake of fossil fuel CO₂: two limiting cases and the real situation Image removed due to copyright restrictions. Citation: Figure 1-1. Broecker, W. S., and T. H. Peng. *Tracers in the Sea*. Eldigio Press Lamont Doherty Geological Observatory, 1982, 690 pages.

> Image removed due to copyright restrictions. Citation: Figure 1-2. Broecker, W. S., and T. H. Peng. *Tracers in the Sea*. Eldigio Press Lamont Doherty Geological Observatory, 1982, 690 pages.

Fossil fuel CO_2 absorption by the ocean: how much, how fast?

How fast does the ocean absorb CO_2 ? What are the important rate- and capacitylimiting processes? How might these processes change in the future?

- <u>Direct observation of changing ocean CO_2 concentrations</u> ("the oceanic Keeling Curve"): this method is difficult because the ocean response is 10% of the atmospheric forcing. The CO_2 content of the atmosphere has increased by 20% over the past 45 years, so ocean water in equilibrium with the atmosphere has only increased by 2%. And most of the absorbed CO_2 has been mixed into a large pre-existing background in the deep ocean, so the signal is much less than 2%.
- <u>Estimation by subtracting out the natural background</u>, based on "Redfield Ratio" stochiometry. This method relies on the higher accuracy of recent measurements and the stoichiometry of the oxidation of marine organic matter. Works reasonably well for North Atlantic, more difficult for Southern Ocean and Pacific (higher background, less certain initial conditions).
- <u>Tracer method, combined with simple robust models</u>: tracers such as bomb tritium and chlorofluorocarbons enter the ocean from the atmospere, much as does CO₂. We can safely assume that water that has tritium and CFCs also has anthropogenic CO₂. The method requires some correction for the chemical differences between these tracers and for the different time histories of emissions. Nonetheless, these corrections are straightforward and the model-dependence is not strong.

Change of pCO₂ at the ocean surface at the JGOFS station HOT over the 13 years period, 1989 -2002



Courtesy of David Karl, University of Hawaii at Manoa. Used with permission.



Outline:

- Seawater CO₂ thermodynamics
- Estimating gas exchange rates
 - Thin film model
 - Piston velocity
 - Wind speed dependence
- Ocean CO₂ exchange
 - Global CO₂ exchange rate
 - Air-sea disequilibrium and spatial variability
- Estimating the penetration of ocean surface waters into the deep ocean
 - Ocean circulation primer
 - Transient tracers
- Estimating ocean uptake of fossil fuel CO_2 : is there a "missing sink"?
- The $\Delta O_2/\Delta CO_2$ method for estimating ocean and biospheric fossil fuel uptake: quantifying the "missing sink"
- Other methods for observing fossil fuel CO₂ uptake
 - δ¹³C
 - "excess CO₂"
 - Historical proxy methods: δ^{13} C in tree rings and corals
- Extrapolating fossil fuel into the future

Physical chemistry of CO_2 in the ocean 1

A. Two useful <u>conservative</u> quantities (properties that mix linearly) are: $\Sigma CO_2 = [CO_2(aq)] + [HCO_3^-] + [CO_3^=] \quad (total dissolved inorganic carbon, DIC)$ Alkalinity = [HCO_3^-] + 2[CO_3^=] + [B(OH)_4^-] + [OH^-] - [H^+]

+(etc...)

"Alkalinity" is a re-arranged charge balance equation which divides ions into those that have acid-base reactions and those that don't:

e.g., in a system consisting of a solution of NaCl, MgSO₄, NaCO₃, and NaHCO₃:

$$[Na^+] + 2[Mg^{++}] - 2[SO_4^-] = [HCO_3^-] + 2[CO_3^-] + [OH^-] - [H^+]$$

= Alkalinity

Adding or removing CO_2 from a water sample does not change the alkalinity (convince yourself of this!)

Operationally in marine chemistry, alkalinity is defined as the number of equivalents of acid needed to bring a sample to the CO_2 endpoint:



Physical chemistry of CO₂ in the ocean ²

"Apparent" thermodynamic constants: because seawater is a "high ionic strength" solution (i.e., it is very salty), conventional thermodynamic constants (activity coefficients, etc.) are difficult to define because of strong ionic interactions. But because the composition of seawater (for major ions) is constant save for variations in total salt content, we can adopt "apparent constants" which incorporate the activity coefficients and ion interactions into the constant (denoted by '):

i.
$$CO_2$$
 (gas) = CO_2 (aq) $Q_3' = \frac{[CO_2(aq)]}{pCO_2} \approx 10^{-1.5}$

ii.
$$CO_2(aq) + H_2O = H^+ + HCO_3^ K_1' = \frac{[H^+][HCO_3^-]}{[CO_2(aq)]} \approx 10^{-6.0}$$

iii.
$$HCO_3^- = H^+ + CO_3^=$$

 $K_2' = \frac{[H^+][CO_3^-]}{[HCO_3^-]} \approx 10^{-9.1}$

iv.
$$B(OH)_3 + H_2O = B(OH)_4^- + H^+$$

 $K_B' = \frac{[H^+] [B(OH)_4^-]}{[B(OH)_3]} \approx 10^{-8.7}$

These "apparent constants" are functions of temperature, salinity, and pressure.

Variables:	Knowns:
pCO ₂	4 equations
[CO ₂ (aq)]	Т
[HCO ₃ -]	S
[CO ₃ =]	Σ B / S
[B(OH) ₃]	2 specified parameters
[B(OH) ₄ -]	(e.g. Alk, ΣCO_2)
[H+]	
Т	
S	
9 variables	9 equations or specified



Real Ocean

Ocean uptake of fossil fuel CO₂: two limiting cases and the real situation

Equilibrium uptake of fossil fuel CO₂

• Using the Revelle Factor, we can explore the consequences when equilibrium between the ocean and atmosphere is attained, given hypothetical changes in p_{CO2} :

Atmosphere(10 ¹⁵ moles)	Mixed Layer	Whole Ocean
60	50	3050
66	50.5	3080

- a. This result indicates that:
- (1) The mixed layer on its own can't take up very much fossil fuel CO₂, and
- (2) The whole ocean would take up ~80% at equilibrium.
- In other words, an equilibrium model cannot account for the 50% uptake ratio. It seems that uptake might have been much more or much less than it has, depending on the extent to which the deep ocean equilibrates.
- b. So we need to know what controls the uptake of CO_2 by the deep ocean.

Fundamental factors controlling ocean fossil fuel CO₂ uptake

- Physical transfers:
 - CO₂ crosses the air-sea interface
 - Chemical equilibrium determines total possible transfer
 - (carbonic acid equilibrium constants, summarized by Revelle Factor)
 - Gas exchange dynamics across the air-sea interface determines the rate of approach to chemical equilibrium. Gas exchange is a function of wind speed and other factors.
 - Estimated from natural ¹⁴C uptake, ²²²Rn deficit, and tracer release experiments
 - CO₂ that dissolves into the surface mixed layer is carried by ocean circulation into the upper ocean and deep sea.
 - How fast does this occur, and what factors affect the rate of circulation?

Outline:

- Seawater CO₂ thermodynamics
- Estimating gas exchange rates
 - Thin film model
 - Piston velocity
 - Wind speed dependence
- Ocean CO₂ exchange
 - Global CO₂ exchange rate
 - Air-sea disequilibrium and spatial variability
- Estimating the penetration of ocean surface waters into the deep ocean
 - Ocean circulation primer
 - Transient tracers
- Estimating ocean uptake of fossil fuel CO_2 : is there a "missing sink"?
- The $\Delta O_2/\Delta CO_2$ method for estimating ocean and biospheric fossil fuel uptake: quantifying the "missing sink"
- Other methods for observing fossil fuel CO₂ uptake
 - **δ**¹³C
 - "excess CO₂"
 - Historical proxy methods: δ^{13} C in tree rings and corals
- Extrapolating fossil fuel into the future

Basic Gas Exchange

- With one exception to be mentioned later, gas exchange should drive the a system that is out of equilibrium towards one that is in equilibrium.
- At equilibrium, gas solubility is proportional to the partial pressure of the gas:

α

• Hence when a gas is out of equilibrium we expect the net flux of the gas our of a fixed surface area to be proportional to the departure from equilibrium, when everything else is constant:

Flux = constant *
$$[C_{equilibrium} - C]$$

l cm⁻² sec⁻¹ cm sec⁻¹ mol cm⁻³

• The proportionality constant, with dimensions of velocity, can be considered as a "gas exchange coefficient". What it means physically, and what it depends on, is a function of the gas exchange model.

mo

Image removed due to copyright restrictions. Citation: Figure 3-2. Broecker, W. S., and T. H. Peng. *Tracers in the Sea*. Eldigio Press Lamont Doherty Geological Observatory, 1982, 690 pages. Stagnant Film Model of Gas Exchange Note: diffusion is random in direction and gas exchange occurs in both directions. A net flux occurs when there is a concentration gradient where there are more atoms going in one direction than in the other.



Piston velocity

- D/z has dimensions of velocity
- Gas exchange diffusion through the stagnant film acts as if two pistons, moving in opposite directions, are sweeping the dissolved gases in and out of the stagnant film.
- Piston velocity for CO_2 in the ocean is about 2000 m/yr



Image removed due to copyright restrictions. Citation: Figure 3-3. Broecker, W. S., and T. H. Peng. *Tracers in the Sea*. Eldigio Press Lamont Doherty Geological Observatory, 1982, 690 pages. ²²²Rn deficit method for determining gas exchange rates Side Track:

Use of natural radioactivity in studying environmental processes 1

- Radiodecay equations.
- 1. <u>dN</u> = λN
 dt

• 2.
$$N = N_o e^{-\lambda t}$$

• 3. The radioactive decay constant is often expressed as a half-life $(t_{1/2})$; i.e., the time it would take for half of the original amount to decay. Setting N = 1/2 N_o in equation 2, then

•
$$t_{1/2} = \ln(2) / \lambda = 0.693 / \lambda$$

Use of natural radioactivity in studying environmental processes 2

- The concentrations of radioactive isotopes are often expressed in terms of their activity, i.e., the rate at which the substance undergoes radioactive decay. This has some obvious advantages (you are expressing the concentration in units similar to the measurement device, e.g. a geiger counter, etc., and it immediately tells you how radioactive the substance is) and one less obvious advantage related to the concept of radioactive equilibrium:
- The activity (A) of a radioisotope is defined as:
- $A = dN/dt = \lambda N$

Use of natural radioactivity in studying environmental processes 3

- 2. Consider a radioactive series consisting of an initial amount of a parent isotope (P_o) and radioactive daughter isotope (D_o):
- P --> D -->

• a. For the parent isotope:

 $dP/dt = -\lambda_P P$; $P = P_0 e^{-\lambda_P t}$

• b. Assuming that at time = 0, D_1 = 0, then:

 $\dots dD_1/dt = +\lambda_P P - \lambda_D D;$

- c. If λP << λD (i.e., the parent is much longer-lived than the daughter), then as t >> t_{1/2} for the daughter isotope (and noting that P = P_o e^{-λp t}),
- $D \cong \lambda_P P / \lambda_D$
- d. That is,

 $\lambda_{\rm D} D = \lambda_{\rm P} P$

 $A_D = A_P$

 e. In other words, given a closed system with a long-lived radioactive parent with a succession of shorter-lived radioactive daughter isotopes (and given enough time), the activities of all the isotopes will be equal. Hence we can use activities to estimate whether or not the system has remained closed for the time appropriate to the half-lives of the given isotopes. Two references on aspects of radioactivity and radiochemistry:

Friedlander, J.W. Kennedy, E.S. Macias, and J.M. Miller, Nuclear and Radiochemistry, Wiley, N.Y., 684 p.

Faure, G., Principles of Isotope Geology, Wiley, N.Y., 589 p.

Global average CO₂ exchange rate from natural radiocarbon

- ¹⁴C is formed at the top of the atmosphere by the interactions of cosmic rays with atmospheric gases
- This ${}^{14}C$ is then (well) mixed in the atmosphere and enters the ocean.
- The decay rate of ¹⁴C in the ocean + atmosphere + biosphere ≈ ocean is equal to the production rate.
- Hence the flux of ¹⁴C into the surface ocean must be equal to the difference in radiocarbon concentration between the atmosphere and mixed layer of the ocean.
- So we can calculate z_{film} from natural radiocarbon.

$$z_{film} = \frac{D [CO_2(aq)]_{surface}}{\lambda h} \frac{1 - [C^*/C]_{mixed-layer}}{[\Sigma CO_2]_{ocean}} \frac{1 - [C^*/C]_{mixed-layer}}{[C^*/C]_{ocean}} / [C^*/C]_{atm}}$$

Gas exchange increases with increasing wind speed



Plot of k_L versus U_{10} for representative oceanic measurements of k_L made using the controlled flux technique (CFT), the deliberate tracer method (DTM), bomb ¹⁴C invasion rates, and the ²²²Rn method. All measurements have been normalized to Sc=600 assuming that $k_L \propto Sc^{-1/2}$ The wind speed parameterizations of *Wanninkhof* [1992] (solid line) and *Liss* and *Merlivat* [1986] (dashed line) are also shown. Data key shown on the figure, Where A is the CFT data of *Haubecker* ans Jahne [1995], B is the DTM data of *Wanninkhof et al.* [1993], C is the DTM data of *Watson et al.* [1991], D is the bomb ¹⁴C data from *Cember* [1989], E is the bomb ¹⁴C data from *Broecker et al.* [1985], F is the ²²²Rn data from *Kromer and Roether* [1983], G is the ²²²Rn data from Peng et al. [1979], H is the ²²²Rn data from *Peng et al.* [1974], and I is the ²²²Rn data from *Broecker and Peng* [1971].

Figure by MIT OpenCourseWare.

Surfactants can also affect gas exchange

Image removed due to copyright restrictions. Citation: Figure 4. Asher and Wanninkhof. *JGR* 103 (1998): 15939. Recent estimates of gas exchange rate as a function of wind speed

Image removed due to copyright restrictions. Citation: Figure 8. McGillis, W. R., et al. *Marine Chemistry* 75 (2001): 267-280.

For a more advanced discussion of the gas exchange process:

- P.S. Liss and L. Merlivat (1986) Air-sea gas exchange rates: introduction and synthesis, in: The Role of Air-Sea Exchange in Geochemical Cycling (ed. P. Buat-Menard et al.), D. Reidel Publishing Co.
- Asher, W., and R. Wanninkhof (1998) Transient tracers and air-sea gas transfer, J. Geophys. Res., 103, 15939-15958,.

Equilibration time for atmospheric gases and the ocean mixed layer



(depth of mixed layer divided by piston velocity - i.e. total gas content divided by gas flux) (change in TCO2 required to change pCO2 in seawater is divided by gas flux: e.g. for a 3% increase in pCO2, CO2(aq) rises by 3% and TCO2 rises by 0.3%; but because TCO2 is ~200x CO2(aq), it then takes 200*.3/3=20x longer

(total carbon dioxide content divided by total gas flux, ~20 moles/m2/yr)

Outline:

- Seawater CO₂ thermodynamics
- Estimating gas exchange rates
 - Thin film model
 - Piston velocity
 - Wind speed dependence
- Ocean CO₂ exchange
 - Global CO₂ exchange rate
 - Air-sea disequilibrium and spatial variability
- Estimating the penetration of ocean surface waters into the deep ocean
 - Ocean circulation primer
 - Transient tracers
- Estimating ocean uptake of fossil fuel CO_2 : is there a "missing sink"?
- The $\Delta O_2 / \Delta CO_2$ method for estimating ocean and biospheric fossil fuel uptake: quantifying the "missing sink"
- Other methods for observing fossil fuel CO₂ uptake
 - **δ**¹³C
 - "excess CO₂"
 - Historical proxy methods: $\delta^{\rm 13}{\rm C}$ in tree rings and corals
- Extrapolating fossil fuel into the future

Rate of exchange of CO_2 between ocean and atmosphere:

 $2000 \text{ m yr}^{-1} * 10^{-5} \text{ moles } \text{kg}^{-1} * 1000 \text{ kg m}^{-3} = 20 \text{ moles } \text{m}^{-2} \text{ yr}^{-1}$

Piston	conc. of	conversion	Exchange rate of CO ₂
velocity	gaseous dissolved CO ₂	factor	across air/sea interface

CO₂ can show strong short-scale variability (e.g. the North Atlantic ocean)

Image removed due to copyright restrictions.

Citation: Figure 1. Watson, Andrew J., C. Robinson, J. E. Robinson, P. J. Leb. Williams, and M. J. R. Fasham. "Spatial Variability in the Sink for Atmospheric Carbon Dioxide in the North Atlantic 50." *Nature* 350 (March 7, 1991).

Change of pCO₂ at the ocean surface at the JGOFS station HOT over the 13 years period, 1989 -2002



Courtesy of David Karl, University of Hawaii at Manoa. Used with permission.

Image removed due to copyright restrictions.

Citation: see image about mean annual flux for 1995 on http://www.ldeo.columbia.edu/res/pi/CO2/.

Estimating Ocean of Fossil Fuel CO₂ Uptake

- CO_2 in the atmosphere equilibrates on a timescale of less than a year. Hence this is not a rate-limiting step (mean life concept).
- The rate-limiting step is the penetration of surface waters into the interior of the ocean.
- In order to estimate ocean CO₂ uptake, we need to find out how fast surface waters move into the deep sea.

Ocean stratification: the thermocline

depth profile from the Northern Indian Ocean (Geosecs Station 400, 9°21'S 95°1'E)



The carbon "solubility pump"



<u>The solubility pump</u>: CO_2 is more soluble in cold waters than in warm waters (the thermal pump), and more soluble in fresher waters than saltier waters (the salt pump). If alkalinity were uniform throughout the ocean and if both cold and warm surface waters equilibrated their p_{CO2} with the atmosphere, then cold surface waters would have a higher dissolved carbon dioxide content than warm surface waters. As these cold surface waters circulate into the deep interior of the ocean, deep waters will have more CO_2 than warm surface waters.



Plot of the solubility of various gases as a function of temperature. The solubility of all gases decreases with increasing temperature, but there exist large differences in the solubility of the different gases for a particular temperature. These differences can be understood in terms of their molecular weight (ideal gas) or other factors, such as molecular interactions between the gas and the water (nonideal gas). Note the change in vertical scale between panels (a) and (b). Based on the empirical functions listed in table 3.2.2.

Figure by MIT OpenCourseWare.

The carbon "biological pump"

• <u>The biological pump</u>: organisms remove carbon and nutrient elements from the surface ocean (which is equilibrated with atmospheric oxygen; note oxygen solubility is a function of temperature); the debris from these organisms sinks and decomposes, releasing carbon and nutrient elements into the deep water and consuming oxygen.

- classical <u>Redfield Ratio</u>:

- $(CH_2O)_{106}(NH_3)_{16}(H_3PO_4) + 138 O_2 -> 106CO_2 + 16HNO_3 + H_3PO_4$
- This stoichiometry proposed by Redfield is based on elemental ratios he observed in ocean water samples and plankton. It considers marine organic matter as if it were a mixture of carbohydrates (CH₂O), proteins (containing NH₃), and phospholipids and nucleic acids (H₃PO₄ bearing). In reality, a broad mixture of compounds occur, and the observed stoichiometry ΔO_2 : ΔC in deep ocean waters implies a higher value (~165), because of the presence more hydrocarbon-like functional groups:
- $(CH_2O)_{111}(CH_4)_{11}(NH_3)_{16}(H_3PO_4) + 165 O_2 = 122 CO_2 + 16 HNO_3 + 149 H_2O + H_3PO_4$
- Note the production of nitric and phosphoric acid in this process; this acid changes alkalinity. Once you acknowledge this process, you also need to take into account another effect that reduces the acid effect on alkalinity by about ¹/₃: the presence of ion-exchanged carboxyl groups:

-
$$(CH_2O)_{102}(CH_4)_{14}(HCOO-Na+)_6(NH_3)_{16}(H_3PO_4) + 165 O_2$$

$$= 122 \text{ CO}_2 + 16 \text{ HNO}_3 + 146 \text{ H}_2\text{O} + \text{H}_3\text{PO}_4 + 6 \text{ NaOH}$$

- There is debate on whether the C:P and N:P stoichiometries are fundamental to marine ecosystems, or whether there is some plasticity (e.g., could N:P = 25?). (There is less debate on variable C:N ratios than for C:P).
- We should also note that some organisms precipitate inorganic shells out of calcium carbonate (CaCO₃) and silica (SiO₂·nH₂O). For example for every 106 organic carbon atoms converted to organic matter, about 22 CaCO₃ molecules are precipitated (ocean-wide average).

Net result of the solubility and biological carbon pumps:



(tropical ocean)

Limiting nutrients

• Concept of the "limiting nutrient": When light and sufficient nutrients are present, organisms will grow until they deplete the "limiting" nutrient to concentrations that are so low that biological uptake is severely limited. The effect of nutrient concentrations on biological growth is often likened to the "Michaelis-Menten" function (used for representing enzymatic activities)

$$Growth = V_{\max} \frac{C}{C + K_{half-saturation}}$$

- where C is the concentration of the nutrient and

 $K_{half\text{-saturation}}$ is the concentration at which the growth rate is half of its maximum value V_{max}



Classically, marine biologists have considered nitrate as the limiting nutrient in most environments (with phosphorus close behind). However, within the past two decades it has been shown that in some environments (so-called "high nutrient low chlorophyll" HNLC), iron is more limiting than nitrogen or phosphorus. Some other trace micronutrients may also be important in some situations (e.g., Zn, Co).